

PATENT COOPERATION TREATY

From the
INTERNATIONAL SEARCHING AUTHORITY

To:

see form PCT/ISA/220

REC'D 03 AUG 2004	
PCT	WIPO PCT

WRITTEN OPINION OF THE INTERNATIONAL SEARCHING AUTHORITY (PCT Rule 43bis.1)

Applicant's or agent's file reference
see form PCT/ISA/220

Date of mailing
(day/month/year) see form PCT/ISA/210 (second sheet)

FOR FURTHER ACTION

See paragraph 2 below

International application No.
PCT/EP2004/050315

International filing date (day/month/year)
17.03.2004

Priority date (day/month/year)
27.03.2003

International Patent Classification (IPC) or both national classification and IPC
C07D211/94, C07C291/04, C07B43/00, C07B33/00

Applicant

CIBA SPECIALTY CHEMICALS HOLDING INC.

1. This opinion contains indications relating to the following items:

- Box No. I Basis of the opinion
- Box No. II Priority
- Box No. III Non-establishment of opinion with regard to novelty, inventive step and industrial applicability
- Box No. IV Lack of unity of invention
- Box No. V Reasoned statement under Rule 43bis.1(a)(i) with regard to novelty, inventive step or industrial applicability; citations and explanations supporting such statement
- Box No. VI Certain documents cited
- Box No. VII Certain defects in the international application
- Box No. VIII Certain observations on the international application

2. **FURTHER ACTION**

If a demand for international preliminary examination is made, this opinion will usually be considered to be a written opinion of the International Preliminary Examining Authority ("IPEA"). However, this does not apply where the applicant chooses an Authority other than this one to be the IPEA and the chosen IPEA has notified the International Bureau under Rule 66.1bis(b) that written opinions of this International Searching Authority will not be so considered.

If this opinion is, as provided above, considered to be a written opinion of the IPEA, the applicant is invited to submit to the IPEA a written reply together, where appropriate, with amendments, before the expiration of three months from the date of mailing of Form PCT/ISA/220 or before the expiration of 22 months from the priority date, whichever expires later.

For further options, see Form PCT/ISA/220.

3. For further details, see notes to Form PCT/ISA/220.

Name and mailing address of the ISA:



European Patent Office
D-80298 Munich
Tel. +49 89 2399 - 0 Tx: 523656 epmu d
Fax: +49 89 2399 - 4465

Authorized Officer

Kleldernigg, O
Telephone No. +49 89 2399-2143



WRITTEN OPINION OF THE
INTERNATIONAL SEARCHING AUTHORITY

International application No.
PCT/EP2004/050315

Box No. I Basis of the opinion

1. With regard to the **language**, this opinion has been established on the basis of the international application in the language in which it was filed, unless otherwise indicated under this item.
 - This opinion has been established on the basis of a translation from the original language into the following language , which is the language of a translation furnished for the purposes of international search (under Rules 12.3 and 23.1(b)).
2. With regard to any **nucleotide and/or amino acid sequence** disclosed in the international application and necessary to the claimed invention, this opinion has been established on the basis of:
 - a. type of material:
 - a sequence listing
 - table(s) related to the sequence listing
 - b. format of material:
 - in written format
 - in computer readable form
 - c. time of filing/furnishing:
 - contained in the international application as filed.
 - filed together with the international application in computer readable form.
 - furnished subsequently to this Authority for the purposes of search.
3. In addition, in the case that more than one version or copy of a sequence listing and/or table relating thereto has been filed or furnished, the required statements that the information in the subsequent or additional copies is identical to that in the application as filed or does not go beyond the application as filed, as appropriate, were furnished.
4. Additional comments:

WRITTEN OPINION OF THE
INTERNATIONAL SEARCHING AUTHORITY

International application No.
PCT/EP2004/050315

Box No. II Priority

1. The following document has not been furnished:

copy of the earlier application whose priority has been claimed (Rule 43bis.1 and 66.7(a)).
 translation of the earlier application whose priority has been claimed (Rule 43bis.1 and 66.7(b)).

Consequently it has not been possible to consider the validity of the priority claim. This opinion has nevertheless been established on the assumption that the relevant date is the claimed priority date.

2. This opinion has been established as if no priority had been claimed due to the fact that the priority claim has been found invalid (Rules 43bis.1 and 64.1). Thus for the purposes of this opinion, the international filing date indicated above is considered to be the relevant date.

3. Additional observations, if necessary:

Box No. V Reasoned statement under Rule 43bis.1(a)(i) with regard to novelty, inventive step or industrial applicability; citations and explanations supporting such statement

1. Statement

Novelty (N)	Yes: Claims	1-10
	No: Claims	
Inventive step (IS)	Yes: Claims	
	No: Claims	1-10
Industrial applicability (IA)	Yes: Claims	1-10
	No: Claims	

2. Citations and explanations

see separate sheet

Re Item V.

D1 : US 6 538 141 B1 (GUERRET OLIVIER ET AL) 25 March 2003 (2003-03-25)
D2 : DE 16 95 749 A (SANKYO CO) 22 April 1971 (1971-04-22)

The present application is directed to a process for the preparation secondary nitroxide radicals from their corresponding secondary amines by oxidation with an organic peracid, comprising the steps a) adding to a reaction vessel a secondary amine, optionally together with an organic solvent and in one batch a base selected from the group selected of alkali metal, alkaline earth metal or ammonium bicarbonates and earth alkaline earth or ammonium carbonates or mixtures thereof in form of a solid together with water or as an aqueous slurry; b) dosing a peracid under stirring to the reaction mixture in an amount of 1.0 - 2.5 mol per mol of secondary amine; and c) isolating the organic phase.

Document D1, which is considered to represent the most relevant state (cf. passages cited in the ISR) differs from the subject matter of the present application insofar that the organic peracid and the base K_2CO_3 are added to the amine simultaneously and not in one batch but continuously upon stirring.

The problem to be solved by the present invention may, therefore, be regarded as the provision of a further process for the preparation secondary nitroxide radicals.

In view of D1 and that only two reagents and/or additives are involved, the skilled person is considered to be capable of modifying the manner of reagents addition to the reaction vessel without exercising any inventive skills in order to solve the problem posed.

The feature of adding the base before the peracid in one batch shows, however, the same effect of avoiding protonation of the secondary amine function, which would decrease the oxidation rate.

Dependent claims 2-10 do not contain any features which, in combination with the features of any claim to which they refer, meet the requirements of the PCT in respect of novelty and/or inventive step (Article 33(2) and (3) PCT).

Thus, the subject matter of claims 1-10 does not fulfil the criteria of Article 33(3) PCT.